

National Electric Power Regulatory Authority ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF PAKISTAN NEPRA Head Office Ataturk Avenue (East) Sector G-5/1, Islamabad. Ph:051-2013200, Fax: 051-2600021

Consumer Affairs Department

TCD.05/ 12-33 -2025 March 20, 2025

Chief Executive Officer (CEO), Lahore Electric Supply Company (LESCO), 22-A, Queen's Road <u>Lahore.</u>

Subject: DECISION IN THE MATTER OF COMPLAINT FILED BY CHIEF ENGINEER (ELECTRICAL), M/S PUNJAB INDUSTRIAL ESTATES DEVELOPMENT & MANAGEMENT COMPANY (PIEDMC), UNDER SECTION 39 OF THE REGULATION OF GENERATION, TRANSMISSION AND DISTRIBUTION OF ELECTRIC POWER ACT, 1997 AGAINST LESCO REGARDING ARREARS IN THE BILL (A/C# 24 11919 9151000). LESCO-NHQ-28428-09-23

Please find enclosed herewith the decision of NEPRA Complaints Resolution Committee (CRC) dated March 20, 2025, regarding the subject matter for necessary action compliance within thirty (30) days.

Encl: As above

Copy to:

- 1. Chief Engineer/Customer Services Director, LESCO, 22-A, Queen's Road, <u>Lahore.</u>
- 2. Manager (Commercial), LESCO, 22-A, Queen's Road, <u>Lahore.</u>
- Rana Rizwan Sibghatullah, Incharge Complaint Cell, (Focal Person to NEPRA) LESCO, 22-A, Queens Road, <u>Lahore.</u>
- Chief Engineer (Electrical), M/s Punjab Industrial Estates Development & -Management Company (PIEDMC), Commercial Area (North), Sundar Industrial Estate, Sundar Raiwind Road, <u>Lahore.</u> <u>info@pie.com.pk</u> 042-35297203

Assistant Director (CAD) NEPRA 20 Islamabad (CAD)



30.1 1108

.

BEFORE THE NATIONAL ELECTRIC POWER REGULATORY AUTHORITY (NEPRA)

Complaint No. LESCO-NHQ-28428-09-23

Chief Engineer (Electrical), **M/s Punjab Industrial Estates Development & - Management Company (PIEDMC)**, Commercial Area (North), Sundar Industrial Estate, Sundar Raiwind Road, <u>Lahore.</u> <u>info@pie.com.pk</u>

Versus

Lahore Electric Supply Company (LESCO) 22-A, Queens Road, <u>Lahore.</u>

۶.

Date of Hearing:November 28, 2023,
January 07, 2025On Behalf of:1)Mr. Muneeb Ahmed Dar, C.E. Electrical (PIEDMC),
Sr. Deputy Manager Electrical (PIEDMC),

Respondent: 1) Mr. Rustam Ali, Dy. Manager, LESCO

Subject: DECISION IN THE MATTER OF COMPLAINT FILED BY CHIEF ENGINEER (ELECTRICAL), M/S PUNJAB INDUSTRIAL ESTATES DEVELOPMENT & MANAGEMENT COMPANY (PIEDMC), UNDER SECTION 39 OF THE REGULATION OF GENERATION, TRANSMISSION AND DISTRIBUTION OF ELECTRIC POWER ACT, 1997 AGAINST LESCO REGARDING ARREARS IN THE BILL (A/C# 24 11919 9151000).

This decision shall dispose of the complaint filed by M/s. Punjab Industrial Estates Development & Management Company (hereinafter referred to as the "Complainant") against Lahore Electric Supply Company Limited (hereinafter referred to as the "Respondent" or "LESCO"), under Section 39 of the Regulation of Generation, Transmission and Distribution of Electric Power Act, 1997 (hereinafter referred to as the "NEPRA Act").

2. Brief facts of the case are that NEPRA received a complaint wherein it was submitted that the Complainant was charged with illegal and unjustified arrears amounting to Rs. 20,889,329/-. The Complainant approached LESCO but the grievances of the Complainant were not redressed. Subsequently, the Complainant approached NEPRA for correction of bill and redressal of his grievances.

3. Accordingly, the matter was taken up with LESCO and hearings were held at NEPRA Headquarters, Islamabad which were attended by representatives of both the parties (i.e., LESCO and the Complainant) who advanced their arguments based on their earlier submissions. After thorough review of documentary evidences submitted by both the parties along with their respective arguments, NEPRA settled the matter and issued the directions to LESCO on January 17, 2024 whereby it was held that "actually the meter reading for the month of June, 2023 was taken on July 01, 2023 whereas the reading date mentioned on the bill is July 03, 2023. Ministry of Energy (Power Division) vide SRO No. 939(I)2023 issued revised schedule for tariff on July 26, 2023 which was

HEPRA bunabad íĊ.

Page 1 of 3

Respondent

Complainant

effective from July 01, 2023. LESCO charged bill for the month of June, 2023 on the new tariff for the days falling in between 1^{st} , 2^{nd} and 3^{rd} July and as a result of which 2251350 units amounting to Rs. 20,889,329/- were charged to the Complainant in the billing month of July, 2023 whereas the difference of tariff rates should have been charged only for July 01, 2023 i.e. the date on which actually/physically meter reading was taken. Accordingly, LESCO was directed to revise the bill excessively charged on account of differential of tariff and adjustment be made in future bills".

4. However, LESCO challenged the aforementioned NEPRA decision dated January 17, 2024 before the Appellate Tribunal (NEPRA) and submitted that neither appellant's version was noted down nor appreciated and only grievance of the Complainant was noted down, and without assigning valid and cogent reasons; the decision was rendered by NEPRA. Accordingly, the Appellate Tribunal (NEPRA) vide decision dated September 2, 2024 remanded the matter to NEPRA and instructed the parties to appear before Consumer Complaints Tribunal, NEPRA on September 25, 2024. Subsequently, further hearings were held at NEPRA Headquarters which were attended by the representatives of both the parties (i.e., LESCO and the Complainant) who advanced their arguments based on their earlier submissions. During the hearing, conducted on January 07, 2025, both the parties agreed to resolve the matter amicably. However, the complainant later approached NEPRA, stating that the issue was not resolved amicably and requested that directives be issued to LESCO for redressal of the grievances.

5. The learned Appellate Tribunal in its decision has made observations that crucial question before the Complaints Tribunal was the date of reading of metering equipments i.e. 01.07.2023 or 03.07.2023 (as is the case of Respondent No. 03 and appellant respectively). Both the parties have documents in support of their version and claim the same to be authentic one. It was the duty of the Tribunal to refer these documents and believe or discard the same for valid and cogent reasons.

6. The case has been examined in detail in light of versions of the parties, documentary evidences placed on record and observations made by the Appellate Tribunal. LESCO has placed its meter reading schedule on record as per which the date of meter reading is mentioned as July 03, 2023 for batch No. 24 for the billing month of June 2023, however, LESCO failed to produce meter reading snaps or any other document to establish that the meter reading was actually recorded on July 03, 2023. Moreover, the meter reading schedule for the month of May 2023 shows meter reading date as June 01, 2023 and for the month of June 2023, the meter reading date is July 03, 2023, and for the month of July 2023, the reading date is August 01, 2023. If we consider the version of LESCO, that the meter reading was taken on July 03, 2023 even the number of days for which the bill was charged exceeds the defined billing period provided in notified tariff terms and conditions. The record reveals that the data of the meter was downloaded by LESCO on November 27, 2023 by LESCO's committee.

i. The data downloading report shows the meter reading of 353.829300 (Rate A) and 64.393800 (Rate B) as on July 01, 2023. The same is depicted below.

Season: Date/Titt	ne of Self Re	Summer ad: 01-Jul-23 12:00 AM kW-Del Maximum Demand	Cumulative Demand	Date/Time
		EW-Del Maximum Demano	0.789450	22-Jun-23 10:29 AM
Rate A	353.829300	0.117650	11 11 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	23-Jun-23 8:29 PM
Rate B	64.393800	0.080050		- •••
Rate C	0.000000	0.000000	0.000000	
Rate D	0.000000	0.000000	0.000000	•
Total 4	18.223100	0.117650	0,789450	22-Jun-23 10:29 AM

DEP

Page 2 of 3

۰, ۱

· . . .

ά,

ii. The bill for the month of June 2023 shows the present reading as 353.829300 (Rate A) and 64.393800 (Rate B) showing reading date as July 03, 2023 as depicted below:

	USTOWER D			140	270,000	1 10'30114		A PEUL ON	17 A CA	Bent Barre 3.4+
	40013	190			1.0%	_xn 23	o . u	23 0	7 AA 23	21 Jul 2
FERINCE W		TABLES	RANGLOAD	GOACH	 n	· · · · ·				
24 1191	981510000	B4 (17	T 68000	24	1919915	10002				
MANACER	ACAIN PUNL			.** 24	13.3	A. CO .	3123316139 (ML) ,Apr 23 - 34 1	1919 915 1009U	. 1312383774 -	
BUNK OF PI	ER RAIWING UNLAB MAIN 237 1962964	DRANCH			11-23,		XIN:0		042363438	21/032005201
		~				(Se Densio	N 101	OUSTERIA	LOWN SON-
a. 6 14171		6.404	Ten No. T	34,000.	<u></u>	-1-51-1	į čestienom da	≫l ava	OUSTERIA	L'OIVN
2++ C 1(2) .78			Ann 142	3Ameriy 1''	A+ 84	150	I IELOER		ANDER IND	
.78			•	ı,	1		IELOER -		MOER IND	(100701)
.78 1940- 16A No. 242 Pro	57 CV3 - 1 J -		•	ı,	arres		FELOER -	ર્ય કર	ANDER IND	(100701)
.78			9 K 720		arres		relota -	e ² SL	ANDER IND	(100701)
.78 100- 164 ha -24- Ph 2837522	50.36		9 85 7200 87 7200 7200		21 00 221	PRESENT	1 1000R -	4 SL MO WETH PACCONT and .12 .00	ANDER IND ARAOHO - Mat 2~ 72000 72000	(100701) Sector Statu Acale
.78 TA No. 24 PM 2837523 2837523 2837523	311 33 30.84				6100 2100 221 2062000	PTE 12 6.1 24 51 2 63 (P) 302400	1 100000 10000 10000 10000 10000 10000 10000	e SL WORKETUN PRESENT and 12	ANDER IND ARAOHO - Mat 2~ 72000 72000	(100701)

It is evident from above that the Complainant was charged bill for the month of June 2023 as per the consumption recorded as on July 01, 2023 and not on July 03, 2023 as claimed by LESCO. Therefore, charging differential amount of tariff by LESCO for the No. of days falling between July 01, 2023 to July 03, 2023 is unjustified.

7. Foregoing in view, LESCO is directed to revise the bill accordingly. Compliance report be submitted to this office within thirty (30) days.

7/ my og (Muhammad Irfan-ul-Haq) (Lashkar Khan Qambrani) Member, Complaints Resolution Committee/ Mémber, Complaints Resolution Committee/ Assistant Legal Advisor Director (CAD) (Naweed Hahi Shaikh) FAIRS DEA Convener, Complaints Resolution Committee, Director General (CAD) NEPRA Islamabad, March χ_0 , 2025 SU Islamabad 20 (CAD)