

National Electric Power Regulatory Authority ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF PAKISTAN NEPRA Head Office Ataturk Avenue (East) Sector G-5/1, Islamabad. Ph:051-2013200, Fax: 051-2600021

Consumer Affairs Department

-2024 TCD.05/ bruary 27, 2024

Chief Executive Officer (CEO), Lahore Electric Supply Company (LESCO), 22-A, Queen's Road <u>Lahore.</u>

Subject: DECISION IN THE MATTER OF COMPLAINT FILED BY MR. JAMSHAID ALI, ZONAL WAREHOUSE MANAGER, M/S MULLAR & PHIPPS PAKISTAN (PVT.) LTD., UNDER SECTION 39 OF THE REGULATION OF GENERATION, TRANSMISSION AND DISTRIBUTION OF ELECTRIC POWER ACT, 1997 AGAINST LESCO REGARDING EXCESSIVE BILLING (A/C# 24 11264 9001304). LESCO-NHQ-24927-05-23

Please find enclosed herewith the decision of NEPRA Consumer Complaints Tribunal, dated February 27, 2024, regarding the subject matter, for necessary action and compliance within fifteen (15) days, positively.

Encl: As above

(Muhammad Bilal) Additional Director (CAD)

Copy to:

- 1. Chief Engineer/Customer Services Director, LESCO, 22-A, Queen's Road, Lahore.
- Manager (Commercial), LESCO, 22-A, Queen's Road, <u>Lahore.</u>
- Rana Rizwan Sibghatullah, Manager/ Incharge Complaint Cell, (Focal Person to NEPRA) LESCO, 22-A, Queens Road, <u>Lahore.</u> Email: <u>dmcs1lesco@gmail.com</u>
- Muhammad Faheem & Co., 4th Floor, Office No. A/2, Dean Arcade, Plot No. DC-4, Block 8, Scheme-5, Kehakshan, Clifton, <u>Karachi.</u> 0308-5200425
- Mr. Jamshaid Ali, Zonal Warehouse Manager, M/s Mullar & Phipps Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd., 26-KM Multan Road, Mouza Maraka, <u>Lahore.</u> 0301-8294561



BEFORE THE NATIONAL ELECTRIC POWER REGULATORY AUTHORITY (NEPRA)

Complaint No. LESCO-NHQ-24927-05-23

Mr. Jamshed Ali, Zonal Warehouse Manager M/s Muller & Phipps Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd., 26-KM Multan Road, Mouza Maraka, <u>Lahore.</u> Cell# 0301-8294561 Complainant

Versus

Lahore Electric Supply Company (LESCO) 22-A, Queen's Road, Lahore.

..... Respondent

Date of Hearings:

- 1) September 11, 2023
- 2) September 20, 2023
- 3) October 11, 2023

On behalf of Complainant:

nt: 1) Mr. Jamshaid Ali, Zonal Warehouse Manager2) Mr. Muhammad Faheem, Advocate High Court

Respondent: Mr. Asif Javed Khalid, Executive Engineer (Operation) Shahpur

Subject: DECISION IN THE MATTER OF COMPLAINT FILED M/S MULLAR & PHIPPS PAKISTAN (PVT.) LTD THROUGH MR. JAMSHAID ALI, ZONAL WAREHOUSE MANAGER, UNDER SECTION 39 OF THE REGULATION OF GENERATION, TRANSMISSION AND DISTRIBUTION OF ELECTRIC POWER ACT, 1997 AGAINST LESCO REGARDING EXCESSIVE BILLING (A/C 24 11264 9001304).

DECISION

This decision shall dispose of the complaint filed by M/s Muller & Phipps Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd. through Mr. Jamsahaid Ali (hereinafter referred to as "the Complainant") against Lahore Electric Supply Company (hereinafter referred to as the "Respondent" or "LESCO"), under Section 39 of the Regulation of Generation, Transmission and Distribution of Electric Power Act, 1997 (hereinafter referred to as the "NEPRA Act").

2. NEPRA received a complaint from Wafaqi Mohtasib (Ombudsman)'s Secretariat, Lahore, filed by Mr. Jamshaid Ali on behalf of M/S Muller & Phipps Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd., wherein the Complainant informed that LESCO had been charging excessive bills since November 2020 due to inaccurate meter reading. The Complainant approached the concerned Sub Division Office, LESCO several times for rectification of the issue but the matter was not resolved and LESCO kept charging excessive units. Furthermore, LESCO also issued a notice to the



Page 1 of 3

Complainant on April 28, 2023 for replacement of the meter. The Complainant requested that directions be issued to LESCO to revise the bills from November, 2020 onwards as per actual reading, any extra amount paid may be refunded and restraining orders may be issued to LESCO regarding replacement of the meter until final disposal of the case.

1

3. The matter was taken up with LESCO for submission of report. In response, LESCO submitted that the consumer's bill had been provisionally corrected and issue will be resolved in the next billing cycle. The report of LESCO was forwarded to the Complainant for information vide letter dated July 12, 2023. However, in response, the Complainant, vide letter dated August 4, 2023, informed that their issue remains unresolved.

In order to proceed further into the matter a hearing was scheduled at NEPRA 4. Head Office, Islamabad on September 11, 2023 which was attended by the Complainant only. Another hearing was subsequently scheduled for September 20, 2023, providing a final opportunity to LESCO to address the matter. The hearing was attended by both the parties (i.e. LESCO and the Complainant) wherein the case was discussed in detail. LESCO could not provide record of the case. During the hearing, LESCO officials were directed to furnish load assessment report, M&T report, and data downloading/retrieval report of the Complainant's meter. In order to finalize the matter a hearing was scheduled on October 11, 2023, which was attended by both parties wherein the case was discussed in detail. During the hearing, LESCO officials informed that the consumer is not being charged units in order to overcome the already charged excessive units, however, LESCO cannot be absolved of its duties by not charging units in subsequent months. As per record provided by LESCO and the Complainant, it was discovered that as of October 2023, the Complainant had been billed excessively for 252,640 units during off-peak hours, while 8640 less units had been charged for peak hours. LESCO officials were unable to provide any explanation for the disparity between units charged to the Complainant and the actual meter reading at site.

5. The case has been examined in detail in light of the record made so available by the parties, arguments advanced during the hearings and applicable law. The following has been observed:

- The Complainant is a consumer of LESCO having a connection with a sanctioned load of 450kW under A-2c(06) tariff running with reference No. 24-11264-9001304.
- (ii) Clause-6.1 of Consumer Service Manual (CSM) provides mechanism of meter reading and Clause-6.1.2 envisages the procedure of percentage checking to ensure accuracy of meter reading. Moreover, according to Clause 6.1.3 of CSM taking snapshot of meter reading is mandatory. Sanctioned load of the Consumer is 450 kW and according to the said provisions of CSM; SDO and XEN are responsible for meter reading of such consumers and percentage checking respectively. The Complainant was charged excessive billing due to sheer negligence of the concerned SDO (Operation).
- (iii) As of October 2023, LESCO billed the Complainant excessively for 252,640 units during off peak hours, while 8640 less units were charged for peak hours. LESCO officials were unable to provide any explanation for the disparity between units charged to the Complainant and the actual meter reading at site.

6. Foregoing in view, LESCO is directed to revise the bill of the Complainant as per actual meter reading and applicable FPA/LPS/taxes be adjusted accordingly

Page 2 of 3

since November, 2020. LESCO is further directed to take disciplinary against the concerned SDO for negligence in accordance with LESCO service rules and concerned XEN (Ops) be directed to ensure percentage checking. Compliance report be submitted within fifteen (15) days.

6. مندر جدبالا حقائق سے پیش نظر، ایسکو کو ہدایت کی جاتی ہے کہ وہ الطح بلنگ سائیکل تک اصل میٹرریڈنگ تصویر سے مطابق شکایت کنندہ سے بل کی تصحیح کرے ادر اس سے مطابق FPA اور LPS کو بھی ایڈ جسٹ کرے۔ مزید بر آل، لا پر داہی بر سنخ پر متعاقد ایس ڈی او سے خلاف لیسکو تو انین کی روشی میں تحکمانہ کاروئی کی جائے ادر متعلقہ ایک میں کو پابند کیا جائے کہ دہ میٹرریڈنگ کی مقرر کر دہ جانچ پڑ تال (percentage checking) کو بیٹین بنائے۔ تعمیل کی رپورٹ پندرہ (15) دنوں سے اندر پیش کی جائے۔

(**Lashkar Khan Qambrani**) Member (Consumer Complaints Tribunal)/ Director (CAD)

ļ

(**Moqeem ul Hassan**) Member Consumer Complaints Tribunal Assistant Legal Advisor (CAD)

(Naweed Illahi Shaikh) Convener Consumer Complaints Tribunal/ Director General (CAD)

Islamabad, February 27, 2024