National Electric Power Regulatory Authority ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF PAKISTAN

inspiral services and services are services are services and services are services are services and services are services

NEPRA Head Office Attaturk Avenue (East) Sector G-5/1, Islamabad. Ph:051-2013200, Fax: 051-2600021

Consumer Affairs Department

TCD.05/825 -2024 February 20, 2024

Chief Executive Officer, Lahore Electric Supply Company (LESCO), 22-A, Queen's Road Lahore.

Subject: DECISION IN THE MATTER OF COMPLAINT FILED BY DR. TAHIR IZHAR UNDER SECTION 39 OF THE REGULATION OF GENERATION, TRANSMISSION AND DISTRIBUTION OF ELECTRIC POWER ACT, 1997 AGAINST LESCO REGARDING EXCESSIVE BILLING (REF# 24 11223 1000321 U) LESCO-LHR-12719-05-22

Please find enclosed herewith the decision of NEPRA Consumer Complaints Tribunal dated February 20, 2024 regarding the subject matter for necessary action and compliance within fifteen (15) days, positively.

Encl: As above

(Muhammad Abid)
Assistant Director (CAD)

NEPOL

Stamman

(CAD)

Copy to:

 C.E/Customer Services Director LESCO, 22-A, Queens Road, <u>Lahore</u>.

 Engr. Dr. Bilal Masood, (Incharge/Additional Director), NEPRA Provincial Office, 1st Floor, Link Arcade, 54B, GECH Society, Phase 3, Link Road, Model Town, <u>Lahore.</u>

 Rana Rizwan Sibghatullah, Incharge Complaint Cell, (Focal Person for NEPRA) LESCO, 22-A, Queens Road, <u>Lahore</u>.

 XEN Raiwind Division, LESCO Lahore Road Raiwind.

Dr. Tahir Izhar,
 R/O 133, Hadbas Moza, Raiwind Sunder, <u>Lahore</u>.
 <u>Cell# 0333-4249247</u>



NATIONAL ELECTRIC POWER REGULATORY AUTHORITY (NEPRA)

Complaint No. LESCO-LHR-12719-05-22

Dr. Tahir Izhar R/O 133, Hadbas Moza, Raiwind Sunder, <u>Lahore</u> . Cell# 0333-4249247	Complainant
Versus	
Lahore Electric Supply Company (LESCO)	Respondent

22-A, Queens Road, <u>Lahore.</u>

January 18, 2024 December 07, 2023 October 18, 2023 August 24, 2023 June 16, 2023

May 23, 2022 January 19, 2023

On behalf of:

Date of Hearing:

Complainant:

Dr. Tahir Izhar

Respondent:

Mr. Amir Ikram, XEN, LESCO

Subject:

DECISION IN THE MATTER OF COMPLAINT FILED BY DR. TAHIR IZHAR UNDER SECTION 39 OF THE REGULATION OF GENERATION, TRANSMISSION AND DISTRIBUTION OF ELECTRIC POWER ACT, 1997 AGAINST LESCO REGARDING EXCESSIVE BILLING (REF# 24 11223 1000321 U)

DECISION

This decision shall dispose of the complaint filed by Dr. Tahir Izhar (hereinafter referred to as "the Complainant") against Lahore Electric Supply Company Limited (hereinafter referred to as the "Respondent" or "LESCO"), under Section 39 of the Regulation of Generation, Transmission and Distribution of Electric Power Act, 1997 (hereinafter referred to as the "NEPRA Act").

- 2. NEPRA received a compliant wherein it was submitted that Complainant was being charged with excessive billing. The Complainant approached LESCO office but LESCO failed to redress grievances of the Complainant. Subsequently, the Complainant approached NEPRA for correction of his bill and redressal of his grievances.
- 3. The matter was taken up with LESCO and a hearing held on May 23, 2022 at NEPRA Provincial Office, Lahore. During the hearing, it was revealed that the Complainant was being charged with excessive billing since long. The Complainant was charged upto 000608 kWh (Off-Peak) & 89 kWh (Peak) reading index upto the month of April, 2022, whereas the actual meter reading as per snap taken on May 06, 2022 was 000559 kWh (Off-Peak) & 00089 kWh (Peak) which shows that the Complainant was charged 49*160 (multiplying factor)=7840 off peak units excessively. Previously, the Complainant was also charged low power factor penalty (LPFP) for months of June-2021, July-2021, August-2021 and November-2021 due to excessive kVARh reading. The Complainant further added that although he is a tax payer consumer and as per policy tax payer consumers are not liable to pay extra tax and further tax, however, LESCO is continuously charging these taxes. LESCO Officials were directed vide letter TCD.05/3238-2022 dated June 02, 2022 to revise

LHR-12719-05-22)

the bill as per snaps and withdraw the wrongly charged amount of Rs. 413,882/-, LPS and LPFP by next billing cycle. Moreover, the concerned RO was also directed to adjust the extra taxes and further taxes of last three (03) months (i.e. February 2022, March 2022 and April 2022) amounting to Rs. 210,155/- which were not payable by the consumer. In compliance of decision of NEPRA, LESCO vide report dated June 23, 2022 submitted that an amount of Rs. 671418/- has been withdrawn from bill of the Complainant and submitted a revised bill. The complainant vide email dated January 18, 2023 informed that his issue has been resolved, therefore, case was closed by this office vide letter dated January 26, 2023.

- 4. Subsequently, the Complainant again approached this office that LESCO has again started excessive billing and requested to re-open the case. In order to proceed further, various hearings were held at NEPRA Provincial Office, Lahore which were attended by both the parties who advanced their arguments based on their earlier submissions.
- 5. The case has been examined in detail in the light of the written/verbal arguments of the parties and applicable law. The following has been concluded:
 - (i) The Complainant is an industrial consumer of LESCO and connection is installed under reference No. 24 11223 1000321 U. The Complainant has sanctioned load of 360 kW. A 3-Phase ToU meter with multiplying factor of 160 is installed at site. The record made so available by both the parties revealed that the Complainant is being charged with excessive billing by LESCO repeatedly (4 times).
 - (ii) Previously the bill of the consumer was corrected on directions of NEPRA but again the Complainant was charged with excessive billing during the month of December, 2023 wherein the Complainant was charged upto 3150 kWh (Off-Peak) & 384 (Peak) reading index whereas the actual meter reading as per snap taken on January 03, 2024 was 2850 kWh (Off-Peak) & 384 (Peak) reading index, as such the Complainant was again charged 300*160(multiply factor) = 48000 units excessively. During the hearing, LESCO officials were directed to justify charging of excessive units from the Complainant, however, they failed to justify the charging of excessive bills to the Complainant. Subsequently, the Complainant approached NEPRA Provincial Office, Lahore on February 09, 2024 and informed that LESCO has again charged him with excessive billing for the month of January, 2024 contrary to the actual meter reading.
 - (iii) Clause-6.1 of Consumer Service Manual (CSM) provides mechanism of meter reading whereby and Clause-6.2 envisages the procedure of percentage checking to ensure accuracy of meter reading. Moreover, Clause 6.1.3 of CSM provides that taking snapshot of meter reading is mandatory. Sanctioned load of the Consumer is 360 kW and according to the said provisions of CSM; SDO and XEN are responsible for meter reading of such consumers and percentage checking respectively. The Complainant was charged excessive billing due to sheer negligence of the concerned SDO (Operation).

7۔ مندرجہ بالا حقائق کے چین نظر الیکوکو ہدایت کی جاتی ہے کہ وہ اسکے بنگ سائیل تک اصل میٹرریڈنگ تصویر کے مطابق شکایت کنندہ کے بال کی تصحیح کرے اور اس کے مطابق FPA اور IPS اور محالت کی جائے اور متعلقہ ایکسٹین کو پابند کیا جائے کہ وہ میٹر IPS کہ وہ میٹر ریڈنگ کی مقرر کر دوجانج پڑتال (percentage classing) کو تین بنائے۔ورج بالاا دکانات پر تغییل کی دیور بے پندرو (15) وٹوں کے اندر چیش کی جائے۔

(Lashkar Khan Qambrani)

(Moqeem-ul-Hassan)

Member, Consumer Complaints Tribunal/
Director (CAD)

Member, Consumer Complaints Tribunal/
Assistant Legal Advisor (CAD)

(Naweed Inahi Shalkh)

Convener, Consumer Complaints Tribunal/

Director General (CAD)

Islamabad, February 2v, 2024

Page 2 of 2

BERRA

Decision - Dr. Tahir Izhar VS LESCO (Case No. LESCO-LHR-12719-05-22)