nepra

National Electric Power Regulatory Authority .

ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF PAKISTAN

Provincial Office

1st Floor, Link Arcade, 54B, GECH Society, Phase 3, Link Road, Model Town, Lahore. Phone: 042-99333931

Consumer Affairs Department

POL.05/26292024 June 14, 2024

Chief Executive Officer Lahore Electric Supply Company (LESCO), 22-A, Queens Road, <u>Lahore</u>.

Subject: DECISION IN THE MATTER OF COMPLAINT FILED BY MR. MUZAFAR HUSSAIN SHAH UNDER SECTION 39 OF THE REGULATION OF GENERATION, TRANSMISSION AND DISTRIBUTION OF ELECTRIC POWER ACT, 1997

AGAINST LESCO REGARDING EXCESSIVE BILLING (REF# 11112610029700 U)

Case No. LESCO-LHR-24373-05-23

Please find enclosed herewith the decision of the NEPRA Complaints Resolution Committee (CRC), dated June 14, 2024 regarding the subject matter for necessary action and compliance within fifteen (15) days, positively.

Encl: As above

(Aisha Kalsoom)
Assistant Director (CAD)

Copy to:

- 1. Chief Engineer/Customer Services Director, LESCO, 22-A, Queen's Road <u>Lahore</u>.
- 2. Rana Rizwan Sibghat Ullah, Manager/Incharge Central Complaint Cell LESCO, (Focal Person, NEPRA) LESCO, 22-A, Queens Road, Lahore.
- 3. S.E 2nd Circle LESCO, 132kv Grid Station, Chandni Chowk, Town Ship, <u>Lahore</u>.
- XEN Shahpur Division, LESCO
 132kV Grid Station, Chung 20-KM Multan Road, <u>Lahore</u>.
- 5. Mr.Muzafar Hussain Shah,
 R/O 1051-E Canal View Housing Society,
 Near Thokar Niaz Baig <u>Lahore</u>.
 Cell#0300-8220222



BEFORE THE NATIONAL ELECTRIC POWER REGULATORY AUTHORITY (NEPRA)

Complaint No. LESCO-LHR-24373-05-23

Mr. Muzafar Hussain Shah,

R/O 1051-E Canal View Housing Society,

Near Thokar Niaz Baig <u>Lahore</u>.

Cell#0300-8220222

Versus

Lahore Electric Supply Company (LESCO)

22-A, Queens Road, Lahore.

Date of Hearing:

August 04, 2023

January 30, 2024 February 29, 2024 June 06, 2024

On behalf of:

Complainant:

Mr. Muzaffar Hussain Shah (Online attended)

Respondent:

Mr. Hassan Raza, SDO, LESCO

Mr. Imran Khalid, RO, LESCO

Subject: DECISION IN THE MATTER OF COMPLAINT FILED BY MR. MUZAFAR HUSSAIN

SHAH UNDER SECTION 39 OF THE REGULATION OF GENERATION, TRANSMISSION AND DISTRIBUTION OF ELECTRIC POWER ACT, 1997 AGAINST

TRANSMISSION AND DISTRIBUTION OF ELECTRIC POWER ACT, 1997 AGAINST LESCO REGARDING EXCESSIVE BILLING (REF# 11112610029700 U)

Case No. LESCO-LHR-24373-05-23

DECISION

This decision shall dispose of the complaint filed by Mr. Muzafar Hussain Shah (hereinafter referred to as "the Complainant") against Lahore Electric Supply Company Limited (hereinafter referred to as the "Respondent" or "LESCO"), under Section 39 of the Regulation of Generation, Transmission and Distribution of Electric Power Act, 1997 (hereinafter referred to as the "NEPRA Act").

- 2. The Complainant in his complaint submitted that LESCO charged him with wrong average billing as his meter burnt during the month of March 2023. The complainant approached LESCO but his grievance was not redressed. Subsequently, the Complainant approached NEPRA for correction of his bill and redressal of his grievance.
- 3. The matter was taken up with LESCO for submission of parawise comments/report. In response, LESCO submitted a report stating that meter of the Complainant was checked and found burnt. Subsequently, the Complainant was charged with open average by LESCO for previous three months as per running load of the Complainant. In order to probe further into the matter, various hearings were held on August 04, 2023, January 30, 2024 and February 29, 2024 respectively at NEPRA Provincial Office, Lahore.
- 4. In order to finalize the matter, another hearing was held on June 06, 2024 at NEPRA Provincial Office, Lahore which was attended by representatives of both the parties who advanced their arguments based on their earlier submissions. During the hearing, LESCO reported that the meter of the Complainant was checked by M&T on September 18, 2023 and found it burnt. Subsequently, the Complainant was charged with detection bill of 919 units during the month of November, 2023 on the basis of connected load (i.e., 3.735 kW) for the period of three months w.e.f. April 2023 to June 2023 by LESCO. LESCO officials were directed to submit the data downloading/retrieval report of the impugned meter of the Complainant. Later on, LESCO reported that the meter of the Complainant burnt and cannot be downloaded.

..... Complainant

..... Respondent

- 5. The case has been examined in detail in the light of the written/verbal arguments of both the parties and applicable law. The following has been concluded:
 - i. The Complainant is a domestic consumer of LESCO and has one connection installed in the name of Mr. Muzafar Hussain Shah, with reference number 11 11261 0029700 U, under the A-1b(03)T tariff. The connection was installed on December 10, 1991. During the hearing, it was revealed that the Complainant's meter brunt during the month of March, 2023 which was replaced in July 2023 and sent to M&T on August 30, 2023 for data downloading. M&T checked the meter on September 18, 2023 and found it burnt. Subsequently, the Complainant was charged with detection bill of 919 units during the month of November, 2023 on the basis of connected load (i.e., 3.735 kW for the period of three months w.e.f. April 2023 to June 2023 by LESCO. Additionally, the Complainant was also being charged with open average billing from March 2023 to July 2023.
 - ii. The complainant apprised that his premises was vacant during this period due to which the consumption was low. He also submitted the Gas bills in support of his arguments which shows the similar consumption pattern like electricity bills. Furthermore, LESCO officials failed to provide any proper evidence to establish theft of electricity supply/using direct supply, therefore, detection bill charged to the Complainant is unjustified. Furthermore, the complainant was being charged with average billing and random units during this disputed period.
 - i. In order to arrive at an informed decision, billing data of the Complainant has been analyzed. The billing history of the Complainant is as follows,

Month/Year	2022	2023 02		Gas Consumption, HM3 (2023)
January	11			0
February	09	12		0
March	19	3 K	288	0
April	16	Detection bill charged (April 2023 to June 2023), random units charged (March 2023) to July 2023)	300	0
May	20	on bill or 2023 to random d (Marc 2023)	260 / 260	0
June	23	Detection bill (April 2023 to 2023), randon charged (Maon to July 2023)	156	0
July	29	Cha cha	327	0
August	47	58		0
September	30	61		0
October	14	24		0
November	04 .	11		0
December	06	08		-
Average	19/month	25/month		0/month

The above data indicates that the billing history of the Complainant is healthy, with an average consumption of 19 units per month in 2022, and 25 units per month excluding the randomly charged units during the period of March 2023 to July 2023. Therefore, the detection bill and open/random average billing charged to the Complainant seems unjustified and the same is required to be withdrawn.

- 6. Relevant Clauses of NEPRA Consumer Service Manual (CSM) elaborate that;
 - 4.3.1 "In case a metering installation becomes defective/burnt (which was otherwise correct up to last billing cycle), DISCO shall:"
 - **4.3.1** (a) "Replace the metering installation immediately or within two billing cycles if meters are not available.".
 - 4.3.1 (b)

 "DISCO may charge bills on average basis i.e., 100% of the consumption recorded in the same months of previous year or average of the last eleven months whichever is higher for a maximum period of two months".

(الف) مندرجه بالانبيرا قوانين كي متعلقه شقول كي روشني ش شكائت كننده كوماه نومبر 2023 ميں چارج كمياً كميا 919 يونش كا ديستيكش بل في الفور ختم كيا جائے۔

- (ب) مارچ 2023 سے جولائی 2023 سک شکائٹ کنندہ کو چارج کیے گئے فرضی (random) یو نٹس بھی واپس لیے جائیں۔
 - (ج) شکائت کنندہ کومارچ 2023 سے جولائی 2023 کے لیے نیرا قوانین کے مطابق ایور جی بنگ چارج کی جائے۔
 - (١) شكائت كننده كاكنكش في الفور بحال كميا جائے۔

درج بالا الكالمات يرعمل كرار يورث بندره (15) يوم ك اندرد فترايداش جح كروائى جائے۔

(Duller (Aisha Kalsoom)

Member Complaints Resolution Committee/Assistant Director (CAD)

Lahore, June 14, 2024

(Engr. Dr. Bilal Masood)

Member Complaints Resolution Committee/Additional Director (CAD)

