

National Electric Power Regulatory Authority

ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF PAKISTAN Regional Office Consumer Affairs Office # 706, 7th Floor, Balad Trade Centre, Aalamgir Road, B.M.C.H.S., Bahadurabad, Karachi

> POK/09/ 2562 /2024 May 23, 2024

Chief Executive Officer, K-Electric Limited, KE House No. 39-B, Sunset Boulevard Phase-II, Defence Housing Authority, Karachi

Subject:

DECISION IN THE MATTER OF MR. ANEEL MUMTAZ S/O MUMTAZ ALI KHAN UNDER SECTION 39 OF THE REGULATION OF GENERATION, TRANSMISSION AND DISTRIBUTION OF ELECTRIC POWER ACT, 1997 AGAINST K-ELECTRIC LIMITED REGARDING DISCONNECTION OF ELECTRIC SUPPLY (REFERENCE NO. LA-149646)

Complaint No. KElectric-KHI-21540-04-23.

Please find enclosed herewith the decision of the NEPRA Regional Office Consumer Affairs dated May 23, 2024 regarding the subject matter for necessary action, further the proceedings in the matter have been closed by this office.

Encl: As above

(Sarmad Wahab Kazi Dy. Director, CAD

Copy to:

- Director General, Consumer Affairs Department, NEPRA, NEPRA Tower, Attaturk Avenue (East), G-5/1, Islamabad
- 2) Mr. M. Imran Hussain Qureshi, Chief Regulatory Affairs & Government Relation Officer, KE Office, 56-A, Street No. 88 G-6/3 Islamabad
- 3) Mr. Aneel Mumtaz S/o Mumtaz Ali Khan, 25-G, Askari Apartment No. 3, School Road, Cantt, Karachi Ph: 03454011715 aneelmumtaz02@gmail.com





NATIONAL ELECTRIC POWER REGULATORY AUTHORITY (NEPRA)

Complaint No. KElectric-KHI-21540-04-23

Mr. Aneel Mumtaz S/o Mumtaz Ali Khan,

Complainant

25-G, Askari Apartment No. 3, School Road, Cantt, Karachi, Contact# 03454011715

Versus

K-Electric Limited (KE)

....... Respondent

KE House No.39B, Sunset Boulevard Defence Housing Authority, Karachi.

Date of Hearing(s):

June 21, 2023

On behalf of:

Complainant:

Mr. Aneel Mumtaz S/o Mumtaz Ali Khan

Respondent:

1) Mr. Asif Shajer (General Manager, Regulations)

2) Mr. Israr Ahmed (Deputy Manager Regulations)

3) Mr. Haider (Manager)

4) Mr. Yasir Alam (Assistant Manager)

Subject: DECISION IN THE MATTER OF COMPLAINT FILED BY MR. ANEEL MUMTAZ
S/O MUMTAZ ALI KHAN UNDER SECTION 39 OF THE REGULATION OF
GENERATION, TRANSMISSION AND DISTRIBUTION OF ELECTRIC
POWER ACT, 1997 AGAINST K-ELECTRIC LIMITED REGARDING
DISCONNECTION OF ELECTRIC SUPPLY (CONSUMER NO. LA-149646)

This decision shall dispose of the Complaint filed by Mr. Aneel Mumtaz S/o Mumtaz Ali Khan, 25-G, Askari Apartment No. 3, School Road, Cantt, Karachi (hereinafter referred to as "the Complainant") against K-Electric Limited (KE) (hereinafter referred to as the "Respondent" or "KE"), under Section 39 of the Regulation of Generation, Transmission and Distribution of Electric Power Act, 1997 (hereinafter referred to as the "NEPRA Act").

2. The brief facts of the case are that NEPRA received the subject complaint regarding reflection of outstanding dues in the column of supplementary billing instead of carry forward balance in the month of April, 2023. The complainant added that KE officials visit the premises and demand for payment of illegal bill and threat for disconnection of electricity supply. The complainant also raised the issue of difference in amounts of outstanding balance in the months of September 2022, October 2022, March 2023 & April 2023 with carry forward balance.

- The matter was taken-up with KE for submission of comments/report. 3. In response, KE vide letter dated May 23, 2023 reported that dues amounting to Rs. 188,411/- are outstanding against the Complainant's connection i.e.LA-149646 whereas last payment was made on March 06, 2023. Hence, supply of the premises was disconnected on May 13, 2023 due to non-payment of monthly bills. The report of KE was sent to Complainant for information/comments on May 24, 2023. Moreover, KE was directed vide letter dated June 15, 2023 to defer the amount of Rs. 71,170/issue current bills to the complainant for payment and restore electric supply after payment of current bills. In response, KE submitted vide letter dated June 19, 2023 that the complainant approached KE in December 2020 for settlement of long standing dues and an easy settlement was proposed by KE which was agreed by the complainant. The said settlement scheme has been completed and due benefit has already been processed as per the settlement plan. Further, an amount of Rs. 200,343/- are outstanding against the complainant's account due to non-payment of monthly bills which were issued as per actual consumption recorded on electricity meter. The complainant was facilitated in the past to allow payment of current bill by temporarily setting aside an amount of Rs. 71,170/- for payment at later stage / month but considering the non-payment of the amount KE requested for reconsideration of the directions.
- 4. Meanwhile, the Complainant also approached office of Wafaqi Mohtasib wherein a hearing was held on June 12, 2023. The Wafaqi Mohtasib closed the proceedings on the ground that the case is under process at NEPRA. In order to proceed further into the matter, a hearing was held on June 21, 2023 at NEPRA Regional office Karachi which was attended by both the parties. During the hearing, the case was discussed at length. The Complainant informed that KE has been issuing excessive bills since past several years. KE submitted that the Complainant approached KE in December 2020 for settlement of long-standing dues and an easy settlement was proposed by KE which was agreed upon by the complainant and the said settlement scheme has been completed and due benefit has already been processed as per the settlement plan. KE added that amount of Rs.200,343/- are outstanding against the complainant's account due to non-payment of monthly bills including the bills for the period from March 2023 to June 2023. KE further submitted that bills have been issued as per the actual consumption recorded through electricity meter and the outstanding dues are genuine and liable to be paid.
- 5. In response to the hearing held on June 21, 2023, the Complainant submitted rejoinder dated July 25, 2023 and raised observations and submitted that as per the record of KE the complainant has paid excessive payment against the bills issued by KE, therefore, disconnection of electricity supply by KE is illegal. Moreover, KE has charged illegal supplementary bill amounting to Rs. 3341/- in the month of February 2023. After adding LPS of Rs. 511.84/-the payable bill for the month of February 2023 was Rs. 9967/- which was paid after the due date however, in the billing month of March 2023, KE again charged Rs. 511.84/-Accordingly, the matter was again taken up with KE vide letter dated August 25, 2023 for submission of report over the rejoinder. In response KE vide letter dated September 14, 2023 submitted report in the matter. In order to arrive at an informed decision some more information pertaining to the billing has been obtained from KE.
- 6. The case has been examined in detail in light of the record made so available by the parties, arguments advanced during the hearing and applicable law. The complaint is disposed of in the following terms:

(i) The billing history of the complainant is as under:

Sr #	Month	Opening Balance	Billed Units	Billing Amount	LPS	Amount Paid	Outstanding Dues	
1	Dec-20	294,648	760	17,630	1,482	0	313,760	
2	Jan-21	313,760	484	7,875	0	-22,630	286,129	
3	Feb-21	286,129	376	5,406	0	-10,407	281,128	
4	Mar-21	281,128	644	13,803	0	-18,803	276,128	
5	Apr-21	276,128	876	20,500	1,723	-27,223	271,128	
6	May-21	271,128	1,008	26,038	0	-31,039	266,127	
7	June-21	266,127	1,452	40,366	3,396	Rebate	283,164	
8	July-21	283,164	1,078	28,283	2,379	-48,763	265,062	
9	Aug-21	265,062	954	27,353	2,140	-35,662	258,893	
10	Sep-21	258,893	983	28,151	2,202	-34,493	254,754	
11	Oct-21	254,754	825	21,614	0	-35,354	241,014	
12	Nov-21	241,014	882	24,713	0	-28,431	237,296	
13	Dec-21	237,296	725	24,212	0	-31,792	229,716	
14	Jan-22	229,716	443	9,876	0	-31,248	193,468	
15	Feb-22	193,468	373	6,126	0	0	199,593	
16	Mar-22	199,593	633	7,994	0	-20,000	74,469	
17	Apr-22	74,469	818	24,420	0	-24,420	74,469	
18	May-22	74,469	943	29,201	0	-29,201	74,469	
19	June-22	74,469	913	31,446	0	-31,447	74,468	
20	July-22	74,468	747	30,714	0	0	105,182	
21	Aug-22	105,182	780	38,610	0	0	143,792	
22	Sep-22	143,792	860	42,104	0	-60,000	117,674	
23	Oct-22	117,674	921	34,823	0	-46,501 -34,823 - 81,324	71,172	
24	Nov-22	71,172	865	33,890	2,652	0	107,714	
25	Dec-22	107,714	616	20,046	0	-36,542	71,171	
26	Jan-23	71,171	502	10165	0	-10,166	71,171	
27	Feb-23	71,171	382	6,113	512	0	81,137	
28	Mar-23	81,137	613	27,877	2,168	-9,967	101,216	
29	Apr-23	101,216	765	40,425	0	0	141,641	
30	May-23	141,641	868	46,770	3,630	0	192,041	

31	June-23	192,041	252	8,302	690	0	201,034	
32	July-23	201,034	0	1,481	133	0	204,248	
33	Aug-23	204,248	0	2,390	200	0	206,837	
34	Sep-23	206,837	0	212	15	0	207,064	
35	Oct-23	207,064	0	2,020	168	0	209,253	
36	Nov-23	209,253	0	2,879	241	0	212,373	
37	Dec-23	212,373	0	212	15	0	212,600	
38	Jan-24	212,600	0	504	40	0	213,143	
39	Feb-24	213,143	0	243	18	0	213,405	
40	Mar-24	213404	0	212		0	213,617	

- (ii) The Complainant is of the view that KE has illegally disconnected the electricity supply of consumer No. No.LA-149646 in March 2023. The record reveals that the Complainant enrolled in rebate scheme in December 2020. At the time of scheme, the outstanding dues against the complainant were Rs. 313760/- and benefit of about Rs.148067/- was proposed to be given to the Complainant and the remaining amount of Rs. 165693/- was to be paid by the complainant.KE provided rebate of Rs. 26726/-, Rs. 113118/- and Rs. 8223/- in the months of June 2021, March 2022 and September 2022 totaling Rs. 148067/-. The bill for the month of February 2023 was not paid by the complainant and at that time the outstanding dues against the complainant were Rs. 81137/- therefore KE disconnected the electricity supply.
- The Complainant has raised the issue of difference in outstanding dues (iii) and carry forward amounts in different months. The above table and the bills issued to the Complainant reflect that the carry forward balance at the end of August 2022 was Rs. 143,792 and the said amount was correctly carried forward in the billing month of September 2022. The outstanding dues at the end of September 2022 were Rs. 117,674 after adjustment of amount paid by the Complainant and rebate given by KE. The said amount of Rs. 117,674 should have been reflected in the bill of October 2022, however, the October 2022 bill and some other bills reflect different amounts of carry forward balance which has created confusion, the current bill for the month of October 2022 amounting to Rs. 34,823 was paid on October 26, 2022. Moreover, an amount of Rs. 46501 was paid on October 7, 2022 as per the billing statement. The outstanding balance of Rs. 71,171 was reflected correctly in the billing month of November 2022 as carry forward balance. The current bill for the month of November 2022 amounting to Rs. 33,890 was not paid by the Complainant and the said amount of Rs. 33,890 appeared in the bill of December 2022 as billing / supplementary bill instead of showing the same in the arrears which also created complications. Similarly, the current bill for the month of March 2023 amounting to Rs. 27,877 was not paid by the complainant and the said amount appeared in the bill of April 2023 as billing / supplementary bill instead of arrears as per provisions of Consumer Service Manual (CSM).

- (iv) The billing statement of the Complainant's connection shows that after the settlement scheme in the month of December 2020, the bills have been charged on normal mode, however, all the bills were not paid by the complainant which resulted in accumulation of outstanding dues and subsequent disconnection of electricity supply.
- (v) The complainant has raised the issue of charging QTR in the month of February 2023. The QTR has been charged as per S.R.O 27(1)/2023 dated January 13, 2023. The bill for the month of January 2023 was issued prior to issuance of the said SRO; therefore, the QTR for the month of October 2022 was charged in the month of February 2023 as supplementary bill. The detailed breakup is as under:

*OTR Details:

From	То	Billing	Tota1	Total	Per Day	Oct-22	No. of	Rate	QTR Adj.
		Month	Days	Consumption	Consumption	Consumption	Days		
5/9/2022	4/10/2022	Oct-22	30	921	30.7	122.8	4	3.2116	394.3845
5/10/2022	4/11/2022	Nov-22	31	865	27.9	735.39	27	3.2116	2419.578
Total									2813.962
Electricity Duty									42
GST									486
Grand Total								3342	

- (vi) The complainant raised a query that the bill for the month of February 2023 was paid with LPS and March 2023 bill was again issued with the LPS amount. The record shows that the complainant paid February 2023 bill on March 06, 2023 and the payment was updated in system on March 07, 2023. In the meantime, March 2023 bill was also generated on the same day i.e. March 07, 2023 and the said LPS charges again reflected in KE bill. The plain reading of the bill shows that the LPS of Rs. 511 has again been charged in the bill of March 2023, however, the billing statement shows that the LPS of Rs. 511 has not been charged in duplication.
- (vii) The payment and billing of the complainant is summarized as under:

Description	Amount (Rs.)		
Outstanding Dues ending Dec-2020	313760		
Rebate Processed / Dues to be withdrawn	(148065)		
by KE under settlement scheme			
Dues to be paid by the complainant under	165695		
settlement scheme (ending Dec-2020)			
Billing Jan-2021 to Mar-2024	732311		
LPS	23804		
Payments Jan-2021 to Mar-2024	(708193)		
Net Outstanding Dues	213617		

(viii) The above billing history / data / tables show that bills have been charged to the Complainant as per actual consumption and no excessive billing / wrong billing has been observed.

- The Consumer Service Manual read with subsequent amendments (ix)provide procedure for charging of supplementary bills. However, the above record reveals that KE has shown previous month QTR and some unpaid bills as supplementary bills. Moreover, the bill for the month of October 2022 and some other months' bills reflect different amounts of balance which has created confusion forward misunderstanding resulting in non-payment of bills by the Complainant, therefore, the Complainant is not liable to be charged LPS. Therefore, KE is required to address this issue and reflect the amounts in the bills in the relevant heads in future as per provisions of Consumer Service Manual (CSM) to avoid any complication.
- 7. In view of foregoing, KE is directed to issue revised bill to the Complainant excluding LPS and ensure issuance of bills in accordance with provisions of Consumer Service Manual (CSM) in future. Further proceedings in the matter are being closed by this office.

(Syed Taqi Abedi)

Dy. Director

Consumer Affairs Deptt.

Advisor

Consumer Affairs Deptt.

May 2^3 , 2024